ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

ANALYSING THE ROBUSTNESS OF DEMOCRACY THROUGH A SCRUTINY OF CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENTS

Mehal Anand

Leiden University, Netherlands

DOI: 10.46609/IJSSER.2022.v07i09.020 URL: https://doi.org/10.46609/IJSSER.2022.v07i09.020

Received: 23 September 2022 / Accepted: 30 September 2022 / Published: 4 October 2022

ABSTRACT

Constitutional democracies are experiencing crisis as leaders across the globe abuse constitutional mechanisms, such as the formal procedure of constitutional amendments to erode democratic order. This article explores the effect of constitutional amendments on the level of democracy and how they vary during the coalition governments and majoritarian governments in India. I conclude that during the coalition era (2004-2014) a positive impact of amendments on democracy has been witnessed. Where constitutional amendments instill democratic principles in the country focusing on protecting and granting freedom guaranteed by the constitution. On the other hand, during the majoritarian period (2014- present) amendments have a negative impact on democracy since they are used as mechanisms to concentrate power into the hands of the government. This research also has its shortcomings given the time constraint it looks at only one country over a very short period of time therefore, the findings are not generalizable. Nevertheless, it opens room for further research qualitatively and quantitatively.

Keywords: constitutional amendment, democracy, coalition government, majoritarian, government

Introduction

Legislatures in parliamentary democracies are the only institutions at the national level that are directly elected by the people and thus are accountable to the citizens (Martin and Vanberg, 2005, p. 93). They also play a significant role in policy making and amending them. For the above reason, while focusing on constitutional amendments in parliamentary systems, with particular respect to the introduction of legislation, the primary emphasis of most political scientists is on understanding the politics of the government (Gamm and Huber, 2002, p. 323). "Since elections usually do not yield a legislative majority for a single party, political elites must engage in a process of complex bargaining that typically results in the formation of multiparty

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

coalitions, which must then strive to retain the confidence of a majority of legislators for the remainder of the parliamentary term" (Martin and Vanberg, 2005, p. 93). For the above reasons, to examine constitutional amendments in parliamentary democracies, one must understand the effects formation of governments can have. Therefore, in the following, the question 'What is the effect of constitutional amendments on quality of democracy?' will be answered through a qualitative content analysis. Theories such as the populist rhetoric and populist constitutions explore ways in which majoritarian governments use "tools of constitutional change to gain power" (Landau, 2018, p. 522). Their main goal is to create "systematic change" wherein basic rules on which democracy stands are changed to their advantage. So, it is easy for them to play off any existing political forces (Sellers, 2021, p. 529). In this way, governments abuse existing institutional order to bring about change by concentrating power and gradually degrading the quality of democracies. In coalition governments, this becomes relatively difficult because of the principal agent problem. It is so because, cooperation requires compromise which in multiparty governance leads to electoral losses because of different party positions. Based on the above theoretical explanation, the following hypothesis is formulated: 'democracy is on a constant decline with the rise of constitutional amendments' which will further be tested.

METHODOLOGY

This section of the paper includes data selection, method of analysis, and coding frame. This paper will be looking at amendment bills passed and examine their impact on the quality of democracy. The author has retrieved the transcripts of the bills passed in the Indian parliament from the PRS legislative research website and examined each original bill text (<u>https://prsindia.org/</u>). However, the number of legislative bills is significant, and given the time constraints of this paper, they all cannot be examined. Therefore, a sampling strategy has been adopted. Randomly every 10th amendment bill passed in the parliament has been reviewed and its effects on democracy have been examined. The recoding unit for this research will be paragraphs, which directly or indirectly affect the political rights and civil liberties in India, thus impacting the quality of democracy.

To examine the effect of constitutional amendments on democracy over the years, author has referred to the Freedom in the World annual global report on political rights and civil liberties by Freedom House. This report gives a holistic view of democracy since it examines countries under two broad umbrellas: political rights and civil liberties. It also further divides them into three and four sub-categories respectively being - electoral process, political pluralism and participation, functioning of government for political rights and freedom of expression and belief, associational and organisational rights, rule of law and personal autonomy and individual rights for civil liberties. With certain amendments made we are likely to see a direct negative effect on peoples' rights and freedoms within a democracy and thus degrading its quality.

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

Freedom house reviews each category in each year's report. Thus, each point difference in the level of democracy can easily be examined. Therefore, for the coding frame of this paper, similar sub-categories and indicators as Freedom House uses in its report on democracy have been used and further also colour coded as shown in the appendix.

Analysis of the result

During the time period of coalition governments in India, most amendments made were not as polarized and focused more on protecting the rights of individuals and societies. They were also more progressive and concentrated on building up democratic values and principles within the country. Although there were some amendments that restrained people's political rights, they were relatively less in number because of the scrutiny each bill went through in the parliament and in the standing committees. Nevertheless, during the majoritarian period, amendments made are extremely polarized since they were not heavily scrutinized as the majority party left no room for debate in the parliament and they did not undergo review from the standing committees. Therefore, the bills passed concentrated power into the hands of the ruling party. Since "Constitutional amendment rules are gatekeepers to a constitution", and when put aside, which they are being today, they often open a window of drastic change to the democratic order of a country (Albert, 2019, p. 2). Thus, degrading the democratic values by directly or indirectly affecting individual's rights. But not all amendments are bad for democracy; some also grant more rights and protect already existing political rights in the country.

Similarly, most amendments passed during coalition governments were such that they focused more on protecting the freedoms of minorities, schedule castes and schedule tribes as guaranteed by the constitutions. But also empowered the organizational and associational rights of all the people. However, this is not always true since there were some amendments that breached civil liberties of the people. As compared to the majoritarian period where most amendments passed also did not directly constrain people's civil liberties. Since they did not change the rights and freedoms guaranteed by the constitution, but indeed made the root of it null and void. Therefore, negatively affecting the quality of democracy by indirectly constraining fundamental rights and freedoms guaranteed by the constitution. Like the Right to Information (amendment) bill, 2019 indirectly politicizes the information commission. So, in a deeper sense, people in India no longer exercise a genuine right to information as the constitution guarantees it.

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

Presentation of Results

Categories	Sub-	Coalition Era (2004-2014)	Majoritarian Period(2014-
Cutegones	categories		present)
	-		1 7
Political Rights	Positive	Amendments seem to have a	During the majoritarian period
	impact on	more positive impact on	amendments have a more
	political	political rights during the	negative impact on democracy,
	Rights	coalition era. Which means	since they are used as
		that they help instill more	mechanisms to concentrate
	Negative	democratic principles in the	power into the hands of the
	impact on	country.	majoritarian party which forms
	political		the government.
	rights		
Civil Liberties	Positive	Similarly, while examining the	Similarly, amendments during
	impact on	impact of amendments on civil	the majoritarian period have a
	civil liberties	liberties, a positive pattern has	more indirect negative impact
		been noticed during the	on civil liberties. They thus
	Negative	coalition period. Amendments	degrade the level of democracy
	impact on	in this time period were more	by limiting the freedoms
	civil liberties	focused on protecting and	guaranteed by the constitution.
		granting the freedoms	
		guaranteed by the constitution.	

Discussion and Conclusion

As discussed in the sections above, constitutional amendments do affect the quality of democracy. While viewed individually, each amendment might not have a large impact on democracy, but when viewed all over a span of time they can cause serious harm or in still democratic principles within a country. Therefore, while answering the research question 'what is the effect of constitutional amendments on the quality of democracy?', it can be concluded that amendments made during the time of coalition governments had a positive impact on democracy, whereas most amendments made during the majoritarian governments have a negative impact on the quality of democracy [refer to Appendix A, Table 1 & 2] for a detailed account of constitutional amendments. Therefore, examining the case of India, an evident pattern as mentioned above has been noticed. Thus, null hypothesis is rejected.

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

Although this research is coherent with existing literature, it cannot be conclusive given the limited scope of the research. The findings cannot be generalizable enough because an extremely small number of amendments over a very short span of time have been examined. Nevertheless, the results found are a starting point for further research into how constitutional amendments affect the quality of democracy particularly when examined under different forms of governments. By looking at various countries with different regime types and examining the amendment bills passed within each of their parliaments the scope of the study can be enlarged. It also opens room for plenty of further qualitative and quantitative research. Additionally, research on the quality of democracy, particularly the phenomenon of democratic backsliding has recently grasped a lot of attention from the society and also in academia and is being researched a lot about. Furthermore, it is a phenomenon that people are more and more interested to read about, thus it holds relevance in today's world and also for the future.

Reference

Albert, R. (2019). Constitutional amendments: making, breaking, and changing constitutions. *Oxford University Press*, 1-4.

Countries and territories. Freedom House. (2022). Retrieved from <u>https://freedomhouse.org/country/india/freedom-world/2022</u>

Gamm, G., & Huber, J. (2002). Legislatures as political institutions: Beyond the contemporary Congress. *Political science: State of the discipline*, 313-43.

Landau, D. (2018). Populist constitutions. University of Chicago Law Review, 85(2), 521-544.

Martin, L., &Vanberg, G. (2005). Coalition Policymaking and Legislative Review. *American Political Science Review*, 99(1), 93-106. doi:10.1017/S0003055405051518

Sellers, M. N. S. (2021). Formal and Informal Constitutional Amendment. In *General Reports of the XXth General Congress of the International Academy of Comparative Law-Rapports généraux du XXèmeCongrèsgénéral de l'Académieinternationale de droit comparé* (pp. 493-506). Springer, Cham.

The citizenship (amendment) bill, 2019. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-citizenship-amendment-bill-2019</u>

The apprentices (amendment) bill, 2007. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-apprentices-amendment-bill-2007</u>

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

The constitution (schedule castes) order (amendment) bill, 2006. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-constitution-scheduled-castes-order-amendment-bill-2006</u>

The maternity benefit (amendment) bill, 2007. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-maternity-benefit-amendment-bill-2007</u>

The constitution (one hundred and eleventh amendment) bill, 2009. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-constitution-111th-amendment-bill-2009</u>

The child labour (prohibition and regulation) amendment bill, 2012. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-child-labour-prohibition-and-regulation-amendment-bill-2012</u>

The representation of people (second amendment) bill, 2008. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-representation-of-the-people-second-amendment-bill-2008</u>

The electricity (amendment) bill, 2005. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-electricity-amendment-bill-2005</u>

The agricultural and processed food products export development authority (amendment) bill, 2008. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-agricultural-and-processed-food-products-export-development-authority-amendment-bill-2008</u>

The Jharkhand Panchayati Raj (amendment) bill, 2010. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved From <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-jharkhand-panchayat-raj-amendment-bill-2010</u>

The information technology (amendment) bill, 2006. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-information-technology-amendment-bill-2006</u>

The maternity benefit (amendment) bill, 2016. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-maternity-benefit-amendment-bill-2016</u>

The mines and minerals (development and regulation) amendment bill, 2021. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-mines-and-minerals-development-and-regulation-amendment-bill-2021</u>

The sugar cess(amendment) bill, 2015. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-sugar-cess-amendment-bill-2015</u>

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

The Lokpal and Lokayuktas (amendment) bill, 2016. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-lokpal-and-lokayuktas-amendment-bill-2016</u>

The constitution (one hundred and twenty-first amendment) bill, 2014. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-constitution-121st-amendment-bill-2014</u>

The Muslim women (protection of rights on marriage) bill, 2019. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-muslim-women-protection-of-rights-on-marriage-bill-2019</u>

The warehousing corporations (amendment) bill, 2015. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-warehousing-corporations-amendment-bill-2015</u>

The right to information (amendment) bill, 2019. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-right-to-information-amendment-bill-2019</u>

The foreign contribution (regulation) amendment bill, 2020. PRS Legislative Research. Retrieved from <u>https://prsindia.org/billtrack/the-foreign-contribution-regulation-amendment-bill-2020</u>

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

Appendix A: Coding frame

Categories	Description	Indicators	Subcategory	Text
Political Rights	Political rights are ights of an ndividual protected by the state.		on political ights	'In order to facilitate speedy trials, it provides that a Special Court (the state government can constitute any number of Special Courts for such areas as may be specified, to facilitate speedy trials of offences) shall be competent to take cognizance of an offence without the accused being committed to it for trial." The apprentices (amendment) bill, 2007) "The Bill seeks the inclusion of new castes based on social, educational and economic backwardness. The Bill makes modifications or mposition of area restrictions in the existing communities. The List of Scheduled Castes was first notified in 1950. The list has been modified several times. The Bill amends the list n respect of 17 communities from the states of Haryana, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Orissa, Punjab and Chattisgarh. The Bill includes synonymous communities in respect of a caste in the existing list." The constitution (scheduled castes) order (amendment) bill, 2006) 'The Bill seeks to amend the Maternity

Table:1 Coding Frame for coalition governments (2004-2014)

ISSN: 2455-8834

		Benefit Act, 1961. The Principal Act egulates the maternity benefit vailable to women in factories, mines, he circus industry, plantations and shops or establishments employing 10 or more persons. It does not cover employees who are covered under the Employees' State Insurance (ESI) for certain periods before and after child- birth. Women entitled to a maternity benefit are also entitled to receive a nedical bonus of Rs 250 from their employer, if no pre-natal confinement and post-natal care is provided by the employer free of charge. The Bill seeks o raise the amount of maternity bonus from Rs. 250 to Rs. 1,000 ." The maternity benefit (amendment) Bill, 2007) The Bill adds a new Directive Principles of State Policy stating that he "State shall endeavour to promote voluntary formation, autonomous unctioning, democratic control and professional management of co- perative societies"."
		employer free of charge. The Bill seeks o raise the amount of maternity bonus from Rs. 250 to Rs. 1,000 ." The maternity benefit (amendment) Bill, 2007) The Bill adds a new Directive Principles of State Policy stating that
		unctioning, democratic control and professional management of co-
		eleventh amendment) bill, 2009) 'The Bill adds a new category of persons called "adolescent". An idolescent means a person between 14 and 18 years of age. The Bill prohibits employment of adolescents in nazardous occupations as specified mines, inflammable substance and nazardous processes)."
	Negative impact on	The child labour (prohibition and

ISSN: 2455-8834

	political rights	egulation) amendment bill, 2012)
		'The Bill bans conducting exit polls and publishing these results from the ime the polls start until all phases of he election are completed. Appeals regarding names on the electoral rolls are submitted to the state chief electoral officer. The Bill allows appeals to be filed with the district magistrate or additional district magistrate." The representation of people (second amendment) bill, 2008)

ISSN: 2455-8834

			1
Civil Liberties	Expression	Positive impact on civil liberties	'It emphasizes that a person cannot be prosecuted for any offence punishable inder the Act without the permission of he Central Government or Appropriate Commission or a Chief Electrical inspector or an Electrical Inspector or icensee or the generating company. An Appropriate Commission could be he Central Regulatory Commission or State Regulatory Commission or Joint Commission. In order to facilitate speedy trials, it provides that a Special Court (the state government can constitute any number of Special Courts for such areas as may be specified, to facilitate speedy trials of offences) shall be competent to take cognizance of an offence without the accused being committed to it for trial." Electricity (amendment) bill, 2005)
			'The Bill amends the 1985 Act to provide for the protection of intellectual property rights of a new category of agricultural products. APEDA is now authorised to undertake prescribed measures for registration and protection of intellectual property rights of 'special products'' within and outside india.'' The agricultural and processed food products export development authority [amendment] bill, 2008)

ISSN: 2455-8834

	Negative impact on civil liberties	'The posts of Mukhia, Pramukhs and Adhyakshas of the District shall be reserved for SCs and STs in proportion of their population. If the reserved seats are less than fifty percent, the remaining seats shall be reserved for DBCs to the extent of their proportion n the population (This provision will not be applicable for Adhyakshas). Out of the total reserved seats, fifty percent of the posts shall be reserved for women belonging to SC, ST and DBCs." The Jharkhand Panchayati Raj amendment) bill, 2010) 'While the Bill provides compensation for unlawful loss or gain arising from inauthorised use of data, it does not address the issue of breach of privacy. The Bill does not cover situations in which an employee who has permission o access certain data misuses such data and also does not mention a punishment in case of child pornopgraphy." The information technology amendment) bill, 2006)

ISSN: 2455-8834

Volume:07, Issue:09 "September 2022"

Categories	Description	Indicators	Subcategory	Text
Rights	, cuto.	Electoral Process Political Pluralism and Participation Functioning of Government	mpact on	'The Act states that every woman will be entitled to maternity benefit of 12 weeks. The Bill increases this o 26 weeks. Under the Act, this naternity benefit should not be availed before six weeks from the late of expected delivery. The Bill changes this to eight weeks." (The maternity benefit (amendment) bill, 2016)
			Negative mpact on political rights	¹ Under the Act, states conduct the auction of mineral concessions other than coal, lignite, and atomic minerals). Mineral concessions nclude mining lease and prospecting icense-cum-mining lease. The Bill empowers the central government to specify a time period for completion of the auction process in consultation with the state government. If the state government is unable to complete the auction process within his period, the auctions may be conducted by the central government." The mines and minerals development and regulation) mendment bill, 2021) The principal Act provides for the mposition of a cess as an excise luty

Table:2 Coding Frame for majoritarian governments (2014-present)

ISSN: 2455-8834

	on the production of sugar The principal Act specifies the ceiling on he cess at Rs 25 per quintal under he Act. The Bill proposes to ncrease this ceiling to Rs 200 per quintal of sugar. The cess has been proposed to be increased in order to neet the government's expenditure on interventions to ensure payment of dues."
	The sugar cess (amendment) bill, 2015)
	The Bill amends the Lokpal and Lokayuktas Act, 2013 in relation to leclaration of assets and liabilities by public servants. The Bill replaces hese provisions to state that a public servant will no longer be required to leclare his assets and liabilities electronically, and also no longer leclare the assets and liabilities of he spouse and dependent children."
	The Lokpal and Lokayuktas amendment) bill, 2016)
	In December 2019, Parliament adopted the Citizenship Amendment Act (CAA), which grants special access to Indian citizenship to non- Muslim immigrants and refugees from neighbouring Muslim-majority states. At the same time, the government moved forward with blans for the creation of a national register of citizens. Many observers believe that the register's purpose is o disenfranchise Muslim voters by effectively classifying them as illegal mmigrants. Importantly, Muslims lisproportionately

ISSN: 2455-8834

		documentation attesting to their place of birth. Undocumented non- Muslims, meanwhile, would be eligible for citizenship through a fast-track process under the CAA." (Freedom House, 2021) (The citizen (amendment) bill, 2019)

ISSN: 2455-8834

Civil Liberties	Civil liberties are now well does the state protect and give freedoms guaranteed by the constitution.	of	Positive mpact on civil iberties	"The Bill amends Article 124 (2) of the Constitution to provide for a Commission, to be known as the National Judicial Appointments Commission (NJAC). The NJAC would then make recommendations to the President for appointments of SC and HC judges." The constitution (one hundred and wenty- first amendment) bill, 2014) The amendment bill makes all leclaration of talaq, including in written or electronic form, to be void i.e. not enforceable in law) and llegal. The Bill makes declaration of alaq a cognizable offence, attracting ip to three years' imprisonment with a fine." The Muslim women (protection of ights on marriage) bill, 2019)
				'The Act requires that the Central Government guarantee the epayment of the principal and innual minimum dividend payments on shares to the central warehousing corporation. The Bill seeks to do away with the Central Government's esponsibility of being a financial guarantor to the central warehousing corporation. Accordingly, provisos o certain sections relating to the government's responsibility of being a guarantor to the central warehousing corporation are proposed to be omitted."

ISSN: 2455-8834

amendment) bill, 2015)
'The Bill amends Sections 13 and 16 of the Right to Information (RTI) Act, 2005. Section 13 of the original Act sets the term of the central Chief information Commissioner and information Commissioners at five years (or until the age of 65, whichever is earlier). The amendment proposes that the appointment will be "for such term as may be prescribed by the Central Government". Again, Section 13 states that salaries, allowances and other terms of service of "the Chief information Commissioner shall be he same as that of the Chief Election Commissioner", and those of an Information Commissioner 'shall be the same as that of an Election Commissioner". The amendment proposes that the salaries, allowances and other terms
of service of the Chief Information Commissioner and the Information Commissioners "shall be such as nay be prescribed by the Central Government"."
The right to information (amendment) bill, 2019)
The Bill amends the Foreign Contribution (Regulation) Act, 2010. Act or the Foreign Contribution Regulation) Act, 1976, the inutilised or unreceived foreign contribution may be utilised or received, only with the prior approval of the central government. The Bill adds that the government nay also restrict usage of unutilised

ISSN: 2455-8834

		nave been	oreign contribution for persons who have been granted prior permission to receive such contribution."		
		The regulation	foreign n) amendment	contribution bill, 2020)	